

# Meeting Report: Workshop on Undertaking Bibliometric Analysis of Migration Health Research

11-13 November 2019

UN Migration Agency, Manila, Philippines



## Background

Assessing the current status of research activity and identifying gaps in research output in international and internal migration and health is an important step in mapping the evidence-base in migration health. Through bibliometric analysis, indicators of published literature in global migration health pertaining to migrants across different categories. Further sub-set analysis along geographic clusters and by health themes such as mental health, malaria, tuberculosis and migration may also be investigated. While there are limitations, bibliometrics allows analysis of size, growth patterns, distributions and mapping of global research productivity. Patterns in publications, authorship analysis, geographical distribution, international research collaboration, important themes discussed, and highly cited articles in the health of migrants can be examined. Bibliometrics is also an important first step in undertaking systematic review.

In 2018, the Migration Health and Development Research Initiative (MHADRI) network members and IOM undertook a Bibliometric analysis of global migration health research. The data showed gaps in the research productivity 'heat map' at global level. Two migration health research workshops held in Nepal and South Africa in 2019 facilitated by a coalition of organizations (IOM, ACMS, QMUL-Migration & Health South Asia network and MHADRI) highlighted the importance of undertaking national, sub-regional and regional 'deep dives' into mapping migration health research output for both

international and internal migrants. Limitations of bibliometric analysis and the need to build robust systems to capture gray literature were also discussed. Consensus on the need to

### Workshop Objectives

#### Framework synthesis:

- Developing a conceptual framework to guide Bibliometric analysis of migration health publications output at national, sub-regional and regional levels – for South & South East Asia
- Framework to guide Bibliometric analysis on Health Assessments for Migrants and Refugees

#### Skills development:

1. To provide an overview and technical instruction on performing an in-depth bibliometric analysis of migration and health-related publications using Scopus.
2. To discuss the use of appropriate visualization tools and software in data representation and reporting.
3. To provide guidance on structuring publications resulting from the bibliometric analysis.
4. To define a framework combining bibliometric review with more conceptual-theoretical and critical review to synthesize thematic and empirical gaps in knowledge.

### Way Forward and Agreed Action Plan

#### (A) Group consensus converged on:

- The importance of bibliometrics as a robust research method to map with a greater degree of sensitivity the research productivity
- Appreciation of its utility and value compared to other systematic and scoping review methods
- Exploring the limitations of bibliometrics to capture breadth or corpus of research output in migration health, of gray literature, limitations of analytics etc
- The lack of existing standards and guidelines in undertaking bibliometric analysis in public health research or beyond in research methods in general
- Strategies for search and approaches to undertaking bibliometric analysis of International migration and internal migration; the nuances of undertaking research algorithms by country, by geography, by migrant typology and by theme were discussed.

To this end there was consensus that was forged on the need for better methodological focus on bibliometrics as a research approach. The participants agreed to forge a technical collaboration to advance the field of bibliometrics research and bibliometrics of migration health research.

**Group name: “The Manila consensus on methodological guidelines in Migration health bibliometric analysis”** (hereby referred to as “*Manila consensus group*”) was forged in order to advance actions towards providing greater clarity methodologically and analytical rigor for bibliometric analysis, and well as applying such standards to the migration health research field. (Technical lead of Consensus Group: Dr Margaret Sampson, Secretariat: MHD Global Research Unit).

It was agreed that the *Manila consensus group* will aim to:

- Support production of a methodological guideline/algorithm in undertaking bibliometric analysis
  - More specifically this involves: Providing feedback/testing of Dr Margaret’s draft checklist algorithm/compass on guidelines in undertaking bibliometrics

- Provide a standardized approach to undertaking bibliometric analysis relevant to Migration health research for international migration and health, and internal migration and health. More specifically this involves:
  - Manila consensus Search strategy for international migration and health with relevant Thesaurus file
  - Manila consensus will act as a technical group to provide methodological feedback to group leads undertaking bibliometrics research projects (as stipulated in action plan below).
- Manila consensus agreed to virtually convene via an online platform for group communications and feedback
- Aim at publishing Scientific Publications relevant to above themes (see below)

## (B) Bibliometric Projects

Three broad trajectories of Bibliometric research project:

- International Migration
- Internal Migration
- Health assessments of migrants and refugees (pre and post-migration)

It was decided that the Philippines Bibliometrics Project (PBP) group will focus on developing the protocol, search strategy and thesaurus file for the bibliometric analysis of **international migration** and health research output, and the Migration & Health South Asia network (hereby termed 'South Asia Bibliometrics Project' (SAP) do the same for bibliometric analysis of **internal migration** and health. The MHD group will focus on migration Health assessments bibliometrics project (HAP).

Overall technical oversight: Dr Margaret Sampson, Administrative oversight: Dr Kol (IOM).

Topic	Primary Question/s	Group	Lead
1. International and internal migrants	<p><b>Primary Question/s</b> (<i>for which groups will work on developing standard templates, search strings, thesaurus files for feedback via Manila Consensus group</i>)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What is the research productivity relating to the health of <b>international migrants?</b> (By migrant typology, country, country of authorship, health thematic focus, institution etc)</li> <li>• What is the research productivity relating to the health of <b>internal migrants?</b> (By migrant typology, country, country of authorship, health thematic focus, institution etc)</li> </ul> <p><b>Secondary Questions for deep-dives are per group direction/focus.</b></p>	Philippines Bibliometrics Project group (PBP): <b>Joel, Melissa, Teddy, Sweet, Kol</b> +(please insert.... )	Joel
		South Asia Bibliometrics Project group (SAP): <b>-Sadika, Anuj, Babu, Roomi, +</b> (please insert.... )	Anuj

<p>2. Studies on pre-migration health assessments (refugees and migrants)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What is the research productivity relating to pre-migration health assessments of migrants and refugees?</li> <li>• How many studies have captured screening outcomes?</li> <li>• Identify/disaggregate countries by site of health assessment and destination country.</li> </ul> <p>Sub-categories:</p> <p><b>Radiology</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What is the research productivity relating to radiological assessments of migrants and refugees?</li> <li>-How many studies have data on radiological outcomes that may be selected for systematic review?</li> </ul> <p><b>Vaccination</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-What is the research productivity relating to vaccination/immunization coverage of migrants and refugees at pre-migration?</li> <li>-How many studies have data on vaccination coverage</li> </ul>	<p>Health assessments bibliometrics project (HAP) project: <b>Sifrash, Mary-Ann, Sweet, Janice, May, Vanessa, Chuck, Kol</b></p> <p><b>Sifrash</b></p> <p><b>May, Mary-Ann, Sweet</b></p>	<p><b>Sweet</b></p>
<p>3. Decision making at Pre-migration phase for prospective international labour migrants (and their families)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What is the research productivity relating to research relating to <b>Decision making at Pre-migration phase</b> for prospective labour migrants (and their families) in low-income countries?</li> </ul>	<p><b>Lucy, Chuck, Kol</b></p>	<p><b>Lucy</b></p>
<p>4. Studies relating to health of migrant workers and their families in China's Belt Road Initiative</p>		<p>Kol, Janice, Sweet, Mary-Ann</p>	<p><b>Kol</b></p>

## (C) Scientific papers (potential)

### General:

1. *Commentary paper* (to anchor the Manila Consensus group): Workshop on Undertaking Bibliometric Analysis of Migration Health Research (*lead: Kol, Margaret, Anuj, Chuck + Manila consensus group*)
2. *Methods/protocol paper*: Margaret's methodological primer on undertaking bibliometric analysis in health research (lead: Margaret with input from Manila consensus group)
3. *Methods paper*: Use and Limitations of method of bibliometrics analysis in relation to migration health – including limitations analysis (*lead: Margaret; Anuj with input from Manila consensus group*)

**Project Specific:** Bibliometrics Analysis papers as per above projects and their leads. *E.g. Bibliometric Analysis of international migration health research in Philippines; Bibliometric Analysis of internal migration health research in selected countries in South Asia.*

## (D) Actions for IOM

### 1. Secretariat function

MHD Global Research Unit will serve as the secretariat for the Manila consensus group and to support bibliometrics projects relevant to migration and health for the group and for future projects.

### 2. Collaboration Platform

- MHD Research Team explored various platforms suggested by participants for project document sharing and communications such as *Sharepoint, Open Science (<https://osf.io/>)* and *Microsoft Teams* etc.
- The MHD research team pilot tested the Microsoft Teams in the weeks following the workshop with the Philippines Bibliometrics Project (PBP) group and found this to be a user-friendly online platform where all the participants collaborate, share documents, edit in real time. **Microsoft Teams** is a unified communication and collaboration platform that combines persistent workplace chat, video meetings, file storage, and application integration. There's no need to download software or register, simply use email login. This software has also been cleared for use by UN IT systems. Positive feedback from the PBP group were received in its use.  
*\*Action: Sweet and Janice to send email to all participants in coming weeks to connect them to the Microsoft Teams page on Manila Consensus group on Bibliometrics.*
- For Group Conference calls, the following options are best: for IOM (<https://www.bluejeans.com/>), For MHADRI (<https://zoom.us/>)

### Scopus Access

- Among the group, Dr's Joel, Roomi and Sadika reported that they don't have access to Scopus. Teddy (UP) said that he can share access to group for the Philippines Bibliometric Project with IOM's Sweet in coordination.
- For the South Asian Group, Dr's Babu and Anuj has *Scopus* access (Dr's Roomi and Sadika can be linked into), and at interim level, Kol said that MHD will facilitate access for those that need to complete their analysis.

## Workshop Evaluation

**Only 3 persons have completed! Please go to: <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/PY2KC2X>** The evaluation will take around 5-7 minutes to complete.

## Photos

All photos are placed [here](#). A separate email will be sent out to the individual email addresses of the participants to ensure ease of access.

## List of Participants

*Facilitator:* **Dr. Margaret Samson**, MHD Consultant on Bibliometric Analysis  
(from Children's Hospital of Eastern Ontario)

Count	Participant	Affiliation
1	Assoc. Prof Charles Hui	Associate Professor, Pediatric Infectious Disease Specialist, University of Ottawa, Canada & Chair, MHADRI network
2	Assoc. Prof Anuj Kapilashrami	Associate Professor, Centre for Global Public Health, Queen Mary University of London
3	Dr Babu Bonta	Scientist & Health of Health Systems Research Indian Council of Medical Research, New Delhi, India
4	Dr Roomi Aziz	Technical Lead Health Data and Communication Pathways to Impact, Pakistan
5	Dr Sadika Akhter	International Centre for Diarrhoeal Disease and Research, Bangladesh ( <a href="http://www.icddr.org">www.icddr.org</a> ) Dhaka, Bangladesh
6	Dr Melissa Garabiles	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines
7	Dr Joel Buenaventura	Head, Migrant Health Unit, Department of Health, Philippines
8	Dr Kol Wickramage	Head, Global Migration Health Research and Epidemiology, MHD, IOM
9	Assoc. Prof Lucy Jordan	Programme Director, Department of Social Work and Social Administration; Associate Dean (UG), Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Hong Kong
10	Mr Teddy Mondres for Prof. Katherine Reyes	Assistant Professor and Associate Dean for Research Department of Health Policy and Administration College of Public Health, University of the Philippines Regional Center for Public Health, Hospital Administration, Environmental and Occupational Health
11	Mary Ann Bautista	IOM (MHD Research Scientist)
12	Sweet Agan	IOM (MHD Research Scientist)
13	Janice Lopez	IOM (MHD Research Communications lead)
14	Dr Sifras Gilaw	IOM (MHD Head, IOM Teleradiology Center), Radiologist
15	Dr Vanessa Madera-Pascual	IOM (MHD MHI, Medical data analyst)
16	May Lebanan	IOM (MHD MHI, Bioinformatics expert/analyst)

*Mr Enrico Ponziani, Director MAC, UN Migration agency participated on Day 3.*